

**Corrected & Updated, 21-May-08**  
*Special Report*

## Is Doty Lucky to be at USM?

### An Investigative Series on CoB Faculty Research Credentials

The new USMNEWS.NET series, "Carrying HoDo . . .," has been a popular one among our readers. This report takes advantage of some of the leftover investigation work-product from that series in order to provide some additional information about former CoB Dean Harold Doty's research record. The information below will likely be of great interest to much of our readership.

**Table 1: Solo-Authorship by Doty & Contemporaries**

YEAR	John Delery	Harold Doty	Chet Miller	Kathleen Sutcliffe
2008				
2007				International Public Management Journal
2006			Academy of Management Journal	Academy of Management Review
2005				International Public Management Journal
				Academy of Management Review
2004				
2003				
2002				
2001				
2000				
1999	Administrative Science Quarterly			
1998	Human Resource Management Review			
1997				
1996				
1995				
1994				Academy of Management Journal
1993	PhD Dissertation			
1992				
1991				PhD Dissertation
1990		PhD Dissertation	PhD Dissertation	

**Sources:** Academic Search Premier, Business Source Premier, and EconLit.

We begin by revisiting the comparisons between the research careers of John Delery, Chet Miller and Kathleen Sutcliffe -- (near-)contemporaries of Doty -- and Doty's

research career. Table 1 above shows the solo-authored journal publications of Doty and the three other management scholars. Each of them has a PhD dissertation that is obviously solo-authored. For Doty and Miller, these appeared in 1990, while Sutcliffe and Delery's dissertations appeared in 1991 and 1993, respectively.

Beyond his 1990 PhD dissertation, Doty's career research record does not contain any solo-authored publications, at least not when it comes to academic journal articles contained in the databases listed in the Table 1 footnote. The same does not apply to Delery, Miller and Sutcliffe. First of all, Miller, another 1990 UT-Austin PhD, published a 2006 solo piece in the *Academy of Management Journal*, arguably the top journal in the field of management. Second, Delery has two solo pieces. The first of these was published in a 1998 issue of *Human Resource Management Review*. The second followed in 1999, and was published in *Administrative Science Quarterly*. According to sources, ASQ is a premier management journal. Finally, Kathleen Sutcliffe's research career (since 1991) is peppered with solo-authored journal publications. The first of these came just three years after her dissertation -- in a 1994 issue of the *Academy of Management Journal*. About one dozen years later, Sutcliffe struck twice again. In 2005 she published solo pieces in the *Academy of Management Review* and the *International Public Management Journal*. With the AMR, Sutcliffe had published solo articles in what sources say are the top two management journals. The next year, 2006, Sutcliffe hit the AMR with a solo piece once again, and in 2007 she published another solo article in the *IPMJ*. Thus, if one considers Sutcliffe's solo work only, she has produced a research record that rivals Doty's entire research career.

Though interesting, Table 1 goes only slightly beyond the case built by the "Carrying HoDo . . ." series. That is that Doty's research has relied almost completely on "**the shoulders of giants**." Some of the other research product that the producers of "Carrying HoDo . . ." left behind goes further, by suggesting that Doty is quite fortunate to be affiliated with the business school at USM. To see what we mean by such a statement, consider the publication information in Table 2 below. That information consists of Doty's journal publications since 1995, the year that CoB associate professor of management and Interim CoB associate dean, Joseph Peyrefitte, got his own research career started. Peyrefitte's publication record is also provided in Table 2 below.

**Table 2: Doty vs. Joseph Peyrefitte, 1995-Present**

YEAR	Harold Doty	Joseph Peyrefitte
2007		Journal of Managerial Issues
2006	Journal of Business Research	International Journal of Management
2005	Journal of Managerial Issues Journal of Management	
2004		Organizational Analysis International Journal of Management
2003		Strategic Organizations
2002		International Journal of Management Management Decision
2001		
2000		
1999		

1998	Academy of Management Journal	Academy of Management Journal Human Resource Management Review
1997		
1996		
1995		

Sources: Academic Search Premier, Business Source Premier, and EconLit.

As Table 2 above indicates, Peyrefitte got the 1995-present period started with two 1995 journal publications. One of these was in the *Academy of Management Journal* -- arguably the top journal in management -- and the other appeared in *Human Resource Management Review*. Peyrefitte was, at this time, an assistant professor of management at Mississippi State University, now a Tier III institution according to *U.S. News & World Report*. The next year, 1996, Doty gets on the board with a publication in the *AMJ*. In 1996, Doty was an associate professor of management at Syracuse University, now a Tier I school.

The 1997-2001 period would turn out to be, to use EFIB chair George Carter's term, a "gappy" one for both Doty and Peyrefitte. Neither would publish a journal article during that time.<sup>1</sup> In 2002, Peyrefitte's journal publication gap would end with the publication of two articles -- one in *Management Decision* and the other in the *International Journal of Management*. In 2003 Peyrefitte would follow these up with a publication in *Strategic Organizations*, and in 2004 Peyrefitte would add two more -- one in the *IJM* and the other in *Organizational Analysis*.

While Peyrefitte had closed off his own 1996-2001 journal publication gap, the journal publication gap that began for Doty in 1997 would continue through 2004. During the latter three years of that "gappy" period, Doty was employed as dean and professor of management at USM. In 2005 Doty ended an eight year drought with two journal publications -- one in the *Journal of Management* and the other in the *Journal of Managerial Issues*. Doty followed 2005 up with a publication in the *Journal of Business Research* in 2006. However, after 2006 Doty began digging another journal publication canyon, while Peyrefitte got back on the board in 2006 and in 2007, with publications in the *IJM* and the *JMI*, respectively.

As Table 2 indicates, Peyrefitte, who is an associate professor, has qualified for the CoB's 2009 Louis K. Brandt Research Award. Not only that, Table 1 shows, according to sources, that his (Peyrefitte's) 1995-2007 journal publication record is at least as good as Doty's. If one considers that Peyrefitte graduated from a Tier IV institution (Florida Atlantic University) and he has spent his years working at Tier III (Mississippi State University) and Tier IV (University of Southern Mississippi) institutions, while Doty graduated from a Tier I institution (UT-Austin) and has spent his years working at Tier II (University of Arkansas), Tier I (Syracuse University) and Tier IV (USM) institutions, Peyrefitte's accomplishments, vis-à-vis Doty's, look even more impressive. As it stands, if new CoB dean Lance Nail is faced with a choice of Doty or Peyrefitte for the CoB's last

<sup>1</sup> Peyrefitte's journal publication "gap" actually spanned from 1996-2001. According to sources, Peyrefitte was delivered a so-called terminal letter by Mississippi State University near (or at) the end of this period. After leaving MSU, Peyrefitte would eventually end up at USM, now a Tier IV institution according to *USNWR*.

BAC or Partnership Society Professorship, the better choice looks, according to sources, to be Peyrefitte.

Table 3 below draws a comparison between Doty and another associate professor management in the CoB, Jon Carr. The information in Table 3 covers the past 10 years of research, 1999-2008, for both Doty and Carr.

**Table 3: Doty vs. Jon Carr, The Last 10 Years**

YEAR	Harold Doty	Jon Carr
2008		Journal of Management
2007		Academy of Management Journal Journal of Business Research Journal of Marketing Theory & Practice
2006	Journal of Business Research	Journal of Management Journal of Real Estate Research
2005	Journal of Managerial Issues Journal of Management	Journal of Marketing Theory & Practice
2004		
2003		Employee Responsibilities & Rights Journal
2002		Journal of Real Estate Research
2001		
2000		
1999		

Sources: Academic Search Premier, Business Source Premier, and EconLit.

Table 3 above conveys, in part, what Table 2 above conveys. That is that Doty's research record contains a dreaded journal publication "gap" from 1999-2004, a period of time that Doty spent much of at Syracuse University, a Tier I institution. Though the publication gap ended for Doty in 2004, it actually began in 1997, not 1999. The time frame covered in Table 3 above corresponds (roughly) to Carr's post-doctorate academic career, so it does not include the 1997-98 period. The only gap in Carr's research program appears in 2004, a one-year gap that is not uncommon in academia.

Our analysis begins in 2002, when Carr published in the *Journal of Real Estate Research*. That first publication was followed by one in the *Employee Responsibilities & Rights Journal* the following year. After a hitless 2004, both Doty and Carr published articles in 2005. Doty published in the *Journal of Management* and the *Journal of Managerial Issues*, while Carr hit the *Journal of Marketing Theory & Practice*. The following year Carr published two journal articles -- one in the *JoM* and another one in the *JRR*. That same year, 2006, Doty published an article in the *Journal of Business Research*. This would be Doty's last.

Carr wasn't done. Carr had a banner year in 2007, publishing articles in the *Academy of Management Journal*, *JBR* and the *JMT&P*. Not only was this Carr's best single year thus far, it was by far better than the best single year Doty has had during his entire 1990-present career. For good measure, Carr followed his stellar 2007 with a 2008 publication in the *JoM*.

There are seven months remaining in 2008, and Carr will likely have other publications. Doty, however, will likely not. Sources tell USMNEWS.NET that few, if any, CoB faculty have seen Doty exhibit any behaviors (since arriving at USM in 2003) that bear a resemblance to academic research.

Again, the data show that Doty's research career falls short of that maintained by two of the CoB's **associate** professors of management. The case of Carr is somewhat like that of Peyrefitte. Carr received his doctorate from what is now a Tier III university (Mississippi State University), and his professional life has been spent at Tier III (MSU) and Tier IV (USM) institutions. Doty, on the other hand, graduated from a Tier I institution (UT-Austin), and spent the majority of his academic life at Tier I (Syracuse University) and Tier II (University of Arkansas) universities. Despite his pedigree and the numerous advantages Doty has had, he (Doty) lags behind both Peyrefitte and Carr when it comes to qualifying for research accolades like the CoB's Louis K. Brandt Award and/or the CoB's BAC and Partnership Society professorships. Carr's recent acceptance of a job offer from Texas Christian University, a Tier II institution, is further evidence that there are CoB management faculty who are seen in a better light by the academic world than is the CoB's Harold Doty.

## Corrected & Updated, 21-May-08

A recent review of this *Special Report* revealed a few errors. These are explained below, starting with the section on Kathleen Sutcliffe. The version of Table 4 below shows where the corrections are made.

**Table 2: Solo-Authorship by Doty & Contemporaries**

YEAR	John Delery	Harold Doty	Chet Miller	Kathleen Sutcliffe
2008				
2007				International Public Management Journal
2006			Academy of Management Journal	Academy of Management Review
2005				International Public Management Journal
				Academy of Management Review
2004				
2003				
2002				
2001				
2000				
1999	Administrative Science			

	Quarterly			
1998	Human Resource Management Review			
1997				
1996				
1995				
1994				Academy of Management Journal
1993	PhD Dissertation			
1992				
1991				PhD Dissertation
1990		PhD Dissertation	PhD Dissertation	

Starting with Sutcliffe, the red frame around the 2007 solo publication in the *International Public Management Journal* reflects that this one was actually a book review, not a research article. Our reference, *Business Source Premier*, noted it as such, but that note was missed by USMNEWS.NET researchers originally. Next, the red frames around Sutcliffe's 2005 and 2006 solo publications in the *Academy of Management Review* also reflect book reviews, and not journal articles. For these two the *Business Source Premier* did not accurately reflect the nature of the contribution in the search results. Even with these corrections, Sutcliffe is left with solo journal publications in the *International Public Management Journal* (2005) and the *Academy of Management Journal* (1994), which is arguably the top journal in management. With these two, Sutcliffe has produced infinitely more solo-authored journal publications than has Doty.

Next we move to a correction to Table 1 involving the solo-authored journal publications for John Delery. The red frame around Delery's 1999 publication in the *Administrative Science Quarterly* reflects a book review, and not a journal article. For this one the *Business Source Premier* did not accurately reflect the nature of the contribution in the search results. Removal of this ASQ contribution from Table 1 leaves Delery with a solo-authored piece in *Human Resource Management Review*. However, and like the case of Sutcliffe, this is infinitely more (in terms solo-authored journal publications) than what Doty's has contributed to the management literature.